

**Electronic Supplementary Material for:**

**RILEM TC 247-DTA Round Robin Test: Carbonation and chloride  
penetration testing of alkali-activated concretes**

(published in *Materials and Structures*)

Gregor J. G. Gluth<sup>1</sup>, Kamel Arbi<sup>2,3</sup>, Susan A. Bernal<sup>4,5</sup>, Dali Bondar<sup>6</sup>, Arnaud Castel<sup>7</sup>, Sundararaman Chithiraputhiran<sup>8</sup>, Alireza Dehghan<sup>9</sup>, Katja Dombrowski-Daube<sup>10</sup>, Ashish Dubey<sup>8</sup>, Vilma Ducman<sup>11</sup>, Karl Peterson<sup>9</sup>, Penny Pipilaki<sup>12</sup>, Siska L. A. Valcke<sup>12</sup>, Guang Ye<sup>2</sup>, Yibing Zuo<sup>2</sup>, John L. Provis<sup>5</sup>\*

<sup>1</sup> Bundesanstalt für Materialforschung und -prüfung (BAM), Unter den Eichen 87, 12205 Berlin, Germany

<sup>2</sup> Faculty of Civil Engineering and Geosciences, Delft University of Technology, Stevinweg 1, 2628 CN, Delft, The Netherlands

<sup>3</sup> Delta Concrete Consult B. V., Marconiweg 2, 4131 PD, Vianen, The Netherlands

<sup>4</sup> School of Civil Engineering, The University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT, UK

<sup>5</sup> Department of Materials Science & Engineering, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S1 3JD, UK

<sup>6</sup> School of Natural and Built Environment, Queen's University Belfast, Belfast BT9 5AG, UK

<sup>7</sup> School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of Technology Sydney, NSW, 2007, Australia

<sup>8</sup> Corporation Innovation Center, USG Corporation, 700 North Highway 45, Libertyville, IL 60048, USA

<sup>9</sup> Department of Civil and Mineral Engineering, University of Toronto, 35 St. George Street, Toronto, ON M5S 1A4, Canada

<sup>10</sup> Institut für Bergbau und Spezialtiefbau, Technische Universität Bergakademie Freiberg, Gustav-Zeuner-Straße 1A, 09599 Freiberg, Germany

<sup>11</sup> Slovenian National Building and Civil Engineering Institute (ZAG), Dimičeva 12, 1000 Ljubljana, Slovenia

<sup>12</sup> Structural Reliability, Netherlands Organisation for Applied Scientific Research (TNO), Stieltjesweg 1, 2628 CK Delft, The Netherlands

\* Corresponding author; e-mail: [j.provis@sheffield.ac.uk](mailto:j.provis@sheffield.ac.uk)

In the following Tables S1–S8, the data reported by the laboratories that participated in the carbonation and chloride penetration testing of RILEM TC 247-DTA are summarised. The data shown in the tables are the mean values and standard deviations (SD) of the experimental results of each laboratory. The means and standard deviations were either reported by the laboratories, or computed from the single-specimen data reported by the respective laboratories. When no standard deviation is given after a mean value, either only one specimen was tested, or no standard deviation and no single specimen values were reported.

In Tables S9–S13, the means ( $X$ ), standard deviations ( $sd$ ) and coefficients of variation (COV), calculated from the mean results of the different laboratories for selected test methods and test durations, are shown.

**Table S1.** Results of the accelerated carbonation testing (EN 13295): depths of carbonation in mm – results reported by laboratories A, B, C, F

	Carbonation duration (d)	Lab A		Lab B		Lab C		Lab F	
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
FA2	0	2.88	0.23						
	7								
	8	7.50	0.27						
	14	8.25	0.60						
	28	9.88	0.52			14.00	3.55		
	42								
	56	12.31	0.53	7.56	0.60	19.35	3.86		
	84								
	90					20.16	4.29		
	91	14.75	0.60						
	180					23.44	5.64		
	182	22.31	0.99						
	365					34.27	4.91		
FA8	0	3.25	0.27						
	7								
	8	9.44	0.62						
	14	10.75	1.07						
	28	12.81	1.31			19.09	4.89		
	42								
	56	16.81	1.94	11.69	0.91	26.29	6.97		
	84								
	90					30.98	5.69		
	91	19.81	2.24						
	180								
	182								
	365								
S1b	0								
	7								
	8								
	14							8.50	
	28					11.75	1.55	11.62	1.06

**Table S1. continued**

	42							
	56			16.13	0.36	12.17	1.34	16.26
	84							0.92
	90					14.13	1.09	
	91							
	180							
	182							
	365							
S3a	0							
	7							
	8							
	14						6.30	0.47
	28					7.49	1.28	8.91
	42							
	56			12.13	0.23	6.06	2.56	11.29
	84							0.91
	90					7.21	1.44	
	91							
	180							
	182							
	365							
MK1	0							
	7							
	8							
	14							
	28							
	42							
	56			15.37	1.43			
	84							
	90							
	91							
	180							
	182							
	365							

**Table S2.** Results of the accelerated carbonation testing (EN 13295): depths of carbonation in mm – results reported by laboratories H and J

	<b>Carbonation duration (d)</b>	<b>Lab H<sup>a</sup></b>		<b>Lab J</b>	
		<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
S1b	0				
	7			5.70	0.34
	8				
	14	9.50	0.71	8.14	0.01
	28	11.50	0.71	11.54	0.20
	42			13.64	0.78
	56	17.00	1.41		
	84	24.50	0.71		
	90				
	91				
	180				
	182				
	365				
MK1	0				
	7				
	8				
	14	>25	-		
	28	>25	-		
	42				
	56	>25	-		
	84	>25	-		
	90				
	91				
	180				
	182				
	365				

<sup>a</sup> Sample dimensions: 50 mm × 50 mm × 50 mm

**Table S3.** Results of the natural carbonation testing – carbonation under controlled exposure conditions using natural levels of carbon dioxide ('indoor'): depths of carbonation in mm

	Carbonation duration (d)	Lab A <sup>a</sup>		Lab B <sup>b</sup>		Lab C <sup>c</sup>		Lab G <sup>d</sup>		Lab I <sup>e</sup>	
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
FA2	0	3.00	0.00								
	28					0.29	0.31				
	56							7.16	0.90		
	90					8.49	3.21				
	91			4.88	0.42						
	125										
	139										
	180					10.47	2.99				
	182	12.95	0.53					14.06	1.30		
	196			6.66	0.70						
	273			8.27	0.35			17.20	2.10		
	274										
	365	15.15	0.19	9.17	0.34	13.79	2.70	20.04	1.60		
	368										
FA8	0	3.38	0.25								
	28					0.00	0.00				
	56							8.88	0.70		
	90					11.53	5.70				
	91			6.24	0.31						
	125										
	139									11	-
	180					18.84	3.13				
	182	16.20	1.86					15.49	1.80		
	196			9.49	0.60						
	273			10.82	0.78			18.10	2.90		
	274										
	365	18.25	0.64	12.81	0.94	24.36	4.58	23.23	4.10		
	368										
S1b	0										
	28					2.41	1.28				
	56					4.94	2.50	6.14	0.70		

**Table S3. continued**

	90				8.58	1.41				
	91			5.77	0.48					
	125									
	139									
	180									
	182			6.58	0.14		10.33	0.90		
	196									
	273						9.92	2.20		
	274			8.51	0.30					
	365						12.84	1.20		
	368			9.00	0.80					
S3a	0									
	28				1.60	0.80				
	56				4.66	2.10	4.41	0.50		
	90				4.83	0.99				
	91			3.57	0.43					
	125									
	139									
	180									
	182			4.92	0.34		8.25	1.10		
	196									
	273						9.85	1.60		
	274			6.28	0.34					
	365						9.04	0.90		
	368			6.14	0.20					
MK1	0									
	28									
	56						9.98	1.20		
	90									
	91			8.36	0.32					
	125								16	-
	139									
	180									
	182			14.18	0.90		17.80	2.30		
	196									
	273						24.45	3.50		

**Table S3.** *continued*

	274			18.92	0.45						
	365							>25	-		
	368			22.27	0.26						

<sup>a</sup> Exposure conditions: temperature: 19 °C, relative humidity: 50 %

<sup>b</sup> Exposure conditions: temperature: 20 °C, relative humidity: 65 %

<sup>c</sup> Exposure conditions not reported

<sup>d</sup> Exposure conditions: temperature: (20 ± 5) °C, relative humidity: ≥50 %; curing times (sealed) before exposure to CO<sub>2</sub>: S1b: 3 days, S3a: 2 days, FA2: 13 days, FA8: 13 days, MK1: 1 day

<sup>e</sup> Exposure conditions: temperature: 19–27 °C, relative humidity: 25–58 %

**Table S4.** Results of the natural carbonation testing – carbonation under natural outdoor conditions protected from rainfall ('sheltered'): depths of carbonation in mm

	Carbonation duration (d)	Lab A		Lab G <sup>a</sup>	
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD
FA2	0	2.88	0.25		
	56			5.33	0.80
	182	4.15	1.22	7.12	1.10
	273			7.49	1.50
	365	7.30	1.18	10.53	1.50
FA8	0	3.13	0.25		
	56			7.10	1.10
	182	6.10	0.89	10.77	1.20
	273			11.70	1.90
	365	7.50	0.66	11.61	2.70
S1b	0				
	56			5.60	0.70
	182			8.96	1.20
	273			9.72	1.00
	365			11.19	1.10
S3a	0				
	56			4.12	0.60
	182			6.39	0.80
	273			6.25	0.60
	365			7.86	1.00
MK1	0				
	56			6.79	1.00
	182			12.84	1.50
	273			17.88	1.60
	365			>20	-

<sup>a</sup> Curing times (sealed) before exposure to CO<sub>2</sub>: S1b: 3 days, S3a: 2 days, FA2: 13 days, FA8: 13 days, MK1: 1 day

**Table S5.** Results of the natural carbonation testing – carbonation under natural conditions exposed to rainfall ('exposed'): depths of carbonation in mm

	<b>Carbonation duration (d)</b>	<b>Lab A</b>		<b>Lab I</b>	
		<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
FA2	0	2.75	0.29		
	126				
	140				
	182	6.55	0.72		
	365	11.70	1.18		
FA8	0	3.13	0.25		
	126				
	140			11	-
	182	6.90	1.01		
	365	12.95	0.85		
MK1	0				
	126			11	-
	140				
	182				
	365				

**Table S6.** Results of the chloride penetration testing – results reported by laboratories B, C, D

		Lab B		Lab C		Lab D	
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
NT BUILD 443 $D_e$ in $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$	FA2						
	FA8	39.0 <sup>b</sup>	+25.0/-14.0 <sup>b</sup>				
	S1b	0.6 <sup>b</sup>	+1.0/-0.4 <sup>b</sup>				
	S3a	1.0 <sup>b</sup>	+1.5/-0.7 <sup>b</sup>				
	MK1	>95 <sup>b</sup>	-				
NT BUILD 492 $D_{nssm}$ in $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$	FA2	41.4	4.0	34.3	4.0		
	FA8	62.0	2.2	33.2	0.5		
	S1b	0.1	0.0	2.1	0.1		
	S3a	0.3	0.1	2.6	0.1		
	MK1	154.4	9.1				
ASTM C 1202 – 28 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b					1261	87
	S3a					3956	478
ASTM C 1202 – 56 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b						
	S3a						
ASTM C 1202 – 91 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b					1292	326
	S3a					2607	600

<sup>a</sup> Curing time of specimens

<sup>b</sup> Profile grinding was not done; instead, chloride penetration depths were determined with the AgNO<sub>3</sub> spray method as in NT BUILD 492. For the computation of the chloride transport coefficient, the Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration at the colour change boundary was assumed to be 0.10 M, and the surface Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration was assumed to be 2.8233 M (equivalent to a NaCl concentration of 165 g/dm<sup>3</sup>). Instead of standard deviations, estimated errors derived from the standard deviations of the measured chloride penetration depths and a possible range of the Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration at the colour change boundary of 0.05–0.20 M are given.

**Table S7.** Results of the chloride penetration testing – results reported by laboratories E, F, G

		Lab E		Lab F		Lab G	
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
NT BUILD 443 $D_e$ in $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$	FA2	54.5	17.7			42.5	-
	FA8	99.0	0.0			94.4	-
	S1b	0.7	0.0			2.8	-
	S3a	1.2	0.0			3.4	-
	MK1						
NT BUILD 492 $D_{\text{nssm}}$ in $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$	FA2	26.8	2.1				
	FA8	79.5	8.4				
	S1b	3.2	0.1	3.8	2.7		
	S3a	2.7	0.1	3.5	0.5		
	MK1						
ASTM C 1202 – 28 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b			610	184		
	S3a			1013	132		
ASTM C 1202 – 56 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b			601	65		
	S3a			884	67		
ASTM C 1202 – 91 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b						
	S3a						

<sup>a</sup> Curing time of specimens

**Table S8.** Results of the chloride penetration testing – results reported by laboratory H

		Lab H	
		Mean	SD
NT BUILD 443 $D_e$ in $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$	FA2		
	FA8		
	S1b	13.2	-
	S3a		
	MK1	59.1	-
NT BUILD 492 $D_{\text{nssm}}$ in $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$	FA2		
	FA8		
	S1b	0.6	0.2
	S3a		
	MK1	79.7	0.7
ASTM C 1202 – 28 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b	217	4
	S3a		
ASTM C 1202 – 56 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b		
	S3a		
ASTM C 1202 – 91 d <sup>a</sup> $Q$ in C	S1b		
	S3a		

**Table S9.** Mean ( $X$ ; in mm), standard deviation ( $sd$ ; in mm), and coefficient of variation (COV), calculated from the mean results of the accelerated carbonation testing (EN 13295) of the participating laboratories after an exposure time of 56 days, for the fly ash-based concretes and the BFS-based concretes

	No. of labs	$X$	$sd$	COV
FA2	3	13.08	5.93	45.4 %
FA8	3	18.26	7.41	40.6 %
S1b	4	15.39	2.18	14.2 %
S3a	3	9.83	3.29	33.5 %

**Table S10.** Mean ( $X$ ; in mm), standard deviation ( $sd$ ; in mm), and coefficient of variation (COV), calculated from the mean results of the carbonation testing under conditions approximating natural exposure ('inside') of the participating laboratories after an exposure time of 365 or 368 days, for the fly ash-based concretes and the BFS-based concretes

	No. of labs	$X$	$sd$	COV
FA2	4	14.54	4.47	30.8 %
FA8	4	19.66	5.29	26.9 %
S1b	2	10.92	2.72	24.9 %
S3a	2	7.59	2.05	27.1 %

**Table S11.** Mean ( $X$ ; in  $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$ ), standard deviation ( $sd$ ; in  $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$ ), and coefficient of variation (COV), calculated from the mean results of the accelerated chloride penetration testing (NT BUILD 443) of the participating laboratories, for the fly ash-based concretes and the BFS-based concretes

	No. of labs	$X$	$sd$	COV
FA2	2	48.5	8.5	17.5 %
FA8	3	77.5	33.4	43.1 %
S1b <sup>a</sup>	3	1.4	1.2	89.9 %
S3a	3	1.9	1.4	73.6 %

<sup>a</sup> The result of laboratory H for concrete S1b was identified as an outlier (according to the  $Q$  test, Dean RB, Dixon WJ (1951) Anal Chem 23:636–638; confidence > 90 %) and, thus, was ignored for the computation of  $X$ ,  $sd$  and the COV.

**Table S12.** Mean ( $X$ ; in  $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$ ), standard deviation ( $sd$ ; in  $10^{-12} \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$ ), and coefficient of variation (COV), calculated from the mean results of the rapid chloride migration testing (NT BUILD 492) of the participating laboratories, for the fly ash-based concretes and the BFS-based concretes

	No. of labs	$X$	$sd$	COV
FA2	3	34.2	7.3	21.3 %
FA8	3	58.3	23.4	40.2 %
S1b	5	1.9	1.6	81.3 %
S3a	4	2.3	1.4	60.2 %

**Table S13.** Mean ( $X$ ; in C), standard deviation ( $sd$ ; in C), and coefficient of variation (COV), calculated from the mean results of the rapid chloride permeability testing (ASTM C1202) of the participating laboratories, for the BFS-based concretes, cured for 28 days

	No. of labs	$X$	$sd$	COV
S1b	3	696	528	75.8 %
S3a	2	2484	2080	83.7 %